



First Year Seminar: Biomedical Ethics

Phil 223 / STS 223

Professor William Seeley, 169 LSP

Office Hours: T/Th 11:00 – 12:30 & by appointment

wseeley@fandm.edu

Course Description:

What is biomedical ethics? Biomedical ethics is a branch of applied ethics dedicated to the evaluation of ethical issues surrounding medical practice. For instance, is it ethically permissible to use Alzheimer's patients in human trials? Does permission of the family make a difference in one's evaluation of this matter? Should nascent technologies whose effects are not fully understood be used to treat patients with chronic health issues? At what point do the risks outweigh the benefits of treatment? How should one go about assessing the relative risks to a fetus of treatment to a pregnant mother in her first trimester? How should one go about determining the status and quality of life of a comatose patient? Does anyone have the right, or the ethical resources, to assess the life options of chronically ill patients? How should genetic screening be used to enhance the health of an individual? Should this tool be used to enhance the general health of the community? In this course we will address issues like these from the perspective of philosophical ethics. Our goal will be to determine whether current ethical theories have the resources to adequately handle these sorts of questions, and, if not, whether they can be modified to meet the moral challenges of contemporary medical practice.

Course Goals:

The goals of this course are threefold. First we will examine a number of particular issues in medicine order to gain a general understanding of problems and methods in biomedical ethics. Second we will evaluate these issues in the broader context of philosophical theories of ethics., e.g. utilitarian and deontological approaches to philosophical ethics. Third, good reasoning is critical to objective discussion of any topic. In this context, we will learn a little bit about standard reasoning strategies and philosophical method.

Requirements:

- Two 2-3 page response paper and two 6 page papers (60%) on assigned topics. The due dates of these papers will be determined by our progress through the syllabus. However they will be due roughly at the midterm and during the final week of the semester. I ask that these papers be submitted electronically to Edisk and as a hard copy in class on the day they are due.
- A cumulative final exam administered during exam week (30%).
- Class participation is mandatory (10%). As a result poor attendance will have a deleterious effect on your grade.
- Late papers will NOT be accepted!
- **Most Importantly**, some ethical issues are controversial. It is critical to the success of class discussion that we remain both open-minded and respectful of the beliefs of others at all times.

Texts:

- Ethical Issues in Modern Medicine, 6th edition, eds. Bonnie Steinbock, John D. Arras, and Alex John London (New York: McGraw Hill), 2003. (**EIMM**)
- Biomedical Ethics, Walter Glannon (New York: Oxford University Press), 2005.
- Electronic resources and edisk files on Edisk.

Schedule of Readings:

Topic 1 : Introduction: A Field Guide for Ethical Theories in Biomedical Ethics

Harmon "Ethics and observation" (*edisk*)
Glannon "History and theories"

Topic 2: Disease, Disability, and the Concept of Normal Function

Disease:
Boorse: "On the Distinction between Disease and Illness" (*edisk*)
Daniels: "Justice and Health Care"
Silvers: "A Fatal Attraction to Normalizing: Treating Disabilities as Deviations from 'Species Typical' Functioning" (*edisk*)
Crouch: "Letting the Deaf Be Deaf" (*edisk*)

See Movie: "The Sound and the Fury"

1st Response paper assigned

Topic 3: The Physician-Patient Relationship

Glannon "The Patient Doctor Relationship" (*edisk*)
Goldman "The Refutation of Medical Paternalism" (*EIMM*)
Emanuel and Emanuel "Four Models of the Physician-Patient Relationship" (*EIMM*)

Topic 4: Genetic Screening

Andrews et al "Social, Legal, and Ethical Implications of Genetic Testing" (*edisk*)
Williams & Sobel: "Neurodegenerative Genetic Conditions: The Example of Huntington Disease" (*edisk*)
Lecture (date TBA): "The Benefits & Risks of Genetic Screening to Patients and Families," Helen Donis-Keller, former Director of Human Genetics, Department of Surgery, Washing University in St. Louis

Supplemental Readings:

Andrews et al "Genetic testing and assessment" (*edisk*)
Andrews et al "Issues in genetic counselling" (*edisk*)

Midterm Paper assigned:

Topic 5: Neuroethics

Wolpe:	"Treatment, Enhancement, and the Ethics of Neurotherapeutics" (<i>edisk</i>)
Farah:	"Neuroethics: The Practical and the Philosophical" (<i>edisk</i>)
Glannon:	"Pharmacological and Psychological Interventions"
Neuroethics Resources	http://neuroethics.upenn.edu/index.html

Supplemental: Neural Prosthetics:

Loeb:	"We made the deaf hear. Now what?" (<i>edisk</i>)
Berger et al:	"Brain Implantable Biomimetic Electronics as Neural Prosthesis for Hippocampal Memory Function" (<i>edisk</i>)

Topic 6: Experimentation on Human Subjects

Glannon:	"Medical Research on Human Subjects" (<i>edisk</i>)
The Nurember Code:	(<i>EIMM</i>)
The Belmont Report:	"Ethical principles and Guidelines for the Protection of Human Subjects of Research" (<i>EIMM</i>)
Miller:	"Sham Surgery: An Ethical Analysis" (<i>edisk</i>)
Glannon:	"Nuerosurgery, Psychosurgery, and Neurostimulation" (<i>edisk</i>)

Supplemental: Brain-Based Interventions:

Nemeroff et al	"VNS Therapy in Treatment Resistant Depression: Evidence and Putative Neurobiological Mechanisms" (<i>edisk</i>)
Hirshberget al	"Emerging Brain-Based Interventions for Children and Adolescents" (<i>edisk</i>)
Loo & Mitchell	"A Review of the Efficacy of TMS Treatment for Depression, and Current and Future Strategies to Optimize Efficacy" (<i>edisk</i>)

2nd Response paper assigned

Topic 7: Cloning and Stem Cell Research

Brock:	"Cloning Human Beings: An Assessment of Ethical Issues Pro & Con" (<i>edisk</i>)
Janeisch:	"Human Cloning-The Science and Ethics of Nuclear Transplantation" (<i>edisk</i>)
Meisner & Janeisch:	"Generation of Nuclear-Transfer Derived Pluripotent ES Cells from Cloned Cdx2-Deficient Blastocysts" (<i>edisk</i>)

Final Paper Assigned

Topic 8: Defintinion of Death

President's Commision	"Defining Death: A Report on the Medical Legal, and Ethical Issues in the Determination of Death" (<i>EIMM</i>)
Culvert & Gert	"The Defintion and Criterion of Death" (<i>edisk</i>)
Veatch	"The Impending Collapse of the Whole -Brain Defintion of Death" (<i>EIMM</i>)
Brody	"How Much of the Brain Must Be Dead" (<i>EIMM</i>)

Bibliography:

Topic 1 : Introduction:

- Gilbert Harmon, "Ethics and Observation," *The Nature of Morality: An Introduction to Ethics* (New York: Oxford University Press), 1977, pp. 3 - 10.
Walter Glannon, "History and Theories" *Biomedical Ethics* (New York: Oxford University Press), 2005, pp. 1 - 22.

Topic 2: Disease, Disability, and the Concept of Normal Function:

- Christopher Boorse, "On the Distinction between Disease and Illness" in Eds. James Lindeman Nelson & Hilde Lindeman Nelson, *Meaning and Medicine* (New York: Routledge), 1999, pp. 16 - 37.
Norman Daniels, "Justice and Health Care," in Eds. Donald Van DeVeer and Tom Regan, *Health Care Ethics: An Introduction* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press), 1987, pp. 290 - 325.
Anita Silvers, "A Fatal Attraction to Normalizing: Treating Disabilities as Deviations from 'Species Typical' Functioning," in Ed. Erik Parens, *Enhancing Human Traits: Ethical and Social Implications* (Washington D.C.: Georgetown University Press), 2000, pp. 95 - 123.
Robert Crouch: "Letting the Deaf Be Deaf," in Eds. James Lindeman Nelson & Hilde Lindeman Nelson, *Meaning and Medicine* (New York: Routledge), 1999, pp. 360 - 370.
"The Sound and the Fury," dir. Josh Aronson (2001).

Topic 3: The Physician-Patient Relationship:

- Walter Glannon, "The Patient Doctor Relationship," *Biomedical Ethics* (New York: Oxford University Press), 2005, pp. 23 - 46.
Alan Goldman, "The Refutation of Medical Paternalism," in Eds. Bonnie Steinbock, John D. Arras, & Alex John London *Ethical Issues in Modern Medicine*, 6th edition, (New York: McGraw Hill), 2003, pp. 56 - 64.
Ezekial Emanuel and Linda Emanuel, "Four Models of the Physician-Patient Relationship," in Eds. Bonnie Steinbock, John D. Arras, & Alex John London *Ethical Issues in Modern Medicine*, 6th edition, (New York: McGraw Hill), 2003, pp. 67 - 76.

Topic 4: Genetic Screening:

- "Social, Legal, and Ethical Implications of Genetic Testing," in Eds. Lori Andrews, Jane Fullarton, Neil Holtzman, & Arno Motulsky, *Assessing Genetic Risks: Implications for Health and Social Policy* (Washington, D.C.: National Academy Press), 1994, pp. 247 - 289.
Williams & Sobel, "Neurodegenerative Genetic Conditions: The Example of Huntington Disease," in Eds. Suzanne Miller, Susan McDaniel, John Roland, & Suzanne Feetham, *Individuals, Families, and the New Era of Genetics: Biopsychosocial Perspectives* (New York: W. W. Norton), 2006, pp. 231 - 247.

Supplemental: Genetic Testing, Assessment, & Counselling:

- "Genetic Testing and Assessment," in Eds. Lori Andrews, Jane Fullarton, Neil Holtzman, & Arno Motulsky, *Assessing Genetic Risks: Implications for Health and Social Policy* (Washington, D.C.: National Academy Press), 1994, pp. 59 - 115.
"Issues in Genetic Counselling," in Eds. Lori Andrews, Jane Fullarton, Neil Holtzman, & Arno Motulsky, *Assessing Genetic Risks: Implications for Health and Social Policy* (Washington, D.C.: National Academy Press), 1994, pp. 146 - 184.

Biomedical Ethics: syllabus

Topic 5: Neuroethics:

- Paul Wolpe, "Treatment, Enhancement, and the Ethics of Neurotherapeutics," *Brain and Cognition* 50 (2002), pp. 387 - 395.
- Marha Farah, "Neuroethics: The Practical and the Philosophical," *Trends in Cognitive Sciences* 9(1), 2005, pp. 34 - 40.
- Walter Glannon, "Pharmacological and Psychological Interventions," *Bioethics and the Brain* (New York: Oxford University Press), 2007, pp. 76 - 115.

Supplemental: Neural Prosthetics:

- Gerald Loeb, "We made the deaf hear. Now what?" in Eds. Theodore Berger & Dennis Glanzman, *Towards Replacement Parts for the Brain: Implatable Biomimetic Electronics as Neural Postheses* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press), 2005, pp. 3 - 14.
- Theodore Berger, Roberta Brinton, Vasilis Mamarelis, Bing Sheu, & Armand Tanguay Jr., "Brain Implantable Biomimetic Electronics as Neural Prosthesis for Hippocampal Memory Function," in Eds. Theodore Berger & Dennis Glanzman, *Towards Replacement Parts for the Brain: Implatable Biomimetic Electronics as Neural Postheses* (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press), 2005, pp. 241 - 276.

Topic 6: Experimentation on Human Subjects:

- Walter Glannon, "Medical Research on Human Subjects," *Biomedical Ethics* (New York: Oxford University Press), 2005, pp. 47 - 70
- "The Nurember Code," in Eds. Bonnie Steinbock, John D. Arras, & Alex John London *Ethical Issues in Modern Medicine*, 6th edition, (New York: McGraw Hill), 2003, pp. 705 - 706.
- The Belmont Report: "Ethical principles and Guidelines for the Protection of Human Subjects of Research," in Eds. Bonnie Steinbock, John D. Arras, and Alex John London *Ethical Issues in Modern Medicine*, 6th edition, (New York: McGraw Hill), 2003, pp. 738 - 745.
- Franklin Miller, "Sham Surgery: An Ethical Analysis," *American Journal of Bioethics* 3(4), 2003, pp. 41 - 48.
- Walter Glannon, "Neurosurgery, Psychosurgery, and Neurostimulation," *Bioethics and the Brain* (New York: Oxford University Press), 2007, pp. 116 - 147.

Supplemental: Brain-Based Interventions:

- Charles Nemeroff, Helen Mayberg, Scott Krahl, James McNamara, Alan Frazier, Thomas Henry, Mark George, Dennis Charney, & Stephen Brannan, "VNS Therapy in Treatment Resistant Depression: Evidence and Putative Neurobiological Mechanisms," *Neuropsychopharmacology* 31 (2006), pp. 1345 - 1355.
- Laurence Hirshberg, Sufen Chiu, & Jean Frazier, "Emerging Brain-Based Interventions for Children and Adolescents," *Child and Adolescent Clinical Psychiatric Clinics of North America* 14 (2005), pp. 1 - 19.
- Colleen Loo & Phillip Mitchell, "A Review of the Efficacy of TMS Treatment for Depression, and Current and Future Strategies to Optimize Efficacy," *Journal of Affective Disorders* 88 (2005), pp. 255 - 267.

Topic 7: Cloning and Stem Cell Research"

- Dan Brock, "Cloning human beings: an assessment of ethical issues pro & con," in Eds. Bonnie Steinbock, John D. Arras, & Alex John London *Ethical Issues in Modern Medicine*, 6th edition, (New York: McGraw Hill), 2003, pp. 631 - 643.
- Rudolph Janeisch, "Human Cloning-The Science and Ethics of Nuclear Transplantation," *New England Journal of Medicine* 351(27), 2004, pp. 2787- 2791.
- Alexander Meissner & Rudolph Janeisch, "Generation of Nuclear-Transfer Derived Pluripotent ES Cells from Cloned Cdx2-Deficient Blastocysts," *Nature* 439(12), 2006, pp. 212 - 215.

Topic 8: Defintinion of Death

- "Defining Death: A Report on the Medical Legal, and Ethical Issues in the Determination of Death," *President's Commission for the Study of Ethical Problems in Medicine*, 1981, in Eds. Bonnie Steinbock, John D. Arras, & Alex John London *Ethical Issues in Modern Medicine*, 6th edition, (New York: McGraw Hill), 2003, pp. 259 - 268.
- Charles Culvert & Bernard Gert, "The Defintion and Criterion of Death" in Eds. Thomas Mappes & David DeGrazia, *Biomedical Ethics*, 5th edition (New York: McGraw-Hill), 2001, pp. 310 - 316.
- Robert Veatch, "The Impending Collapse of the Whole -Brain Defintion of Death," in Eds. Bonnie Steinbock, John D. Arras, & Alex John London *Ethical Issues in Modern Medicine*, 6th edition, (New York: McGraw Hill), 2003, pp. 268 - 276.
- Baruch Brody, "How Much of the Brain Must be Dead, in Eds. Bonnie Steinbock, John D. Arras, & Alex John London *Ethical Issues in Modern Medicine*, 6th edition, (New York: McGraw Hill), 2003, pp. 277 - 282.

Some Miscellaneous Notes and Guidelines:

Moral behavior is the grounds for, and the framework of, a healthy society. In this regard it is each of our responsibility as an individual within the community of our classroom to act responsibly. This includes following the rules and guidelines set out by the College for academic behavior. Plagiarism is a serious matter. It goes without saying that each of you is expected to do his or her own work and to cite EVERY text that is used to prepare a paper for this class. In general philosophy papers are NOT research papers. Your response papers should not involve any outside research and you should be able to manage your final papers using only material from the syllabus, assigned supplemental readings, and class discussion.

As a general rule, I ask that you not use the internet for your research except as assigned in class.

The two assigned papers are designed to give students a chance to stretch their legs a bit with the material and give me a chance to assess your understanding of the material. These papers should offer a philosophical defense of your take on the issue at hand. But this does not mean that they are a free forum for opinions. Make sure that your papers set out the philosophical issues germane to the question and that your responses address the relative virtues and shortcomings of theoretical positions discussed in class.

Finally, the reading list for this class is arranged in topics as opposed to individual sessions. I will announce the particular readings for each class as we go along. This will allow us some flexibility in discussion so that we can spend more time on issues of interest to the class. I will also occasionally upload supplementary materials to Edisk for students interested in pursuing particular issues beyond class discussion.